In the Matter of

Case No.: 1:21-cv-08594-JHR

ROSATI

٧.

LONG ISLAND RAILROAD, et al.

Deposition of Michele Walsh

Thursday, August 17, 2023

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
-----X

STEVEN ROSATI, an individual,

Plaintiff,

-against-

Case No.: 1:21-cv-08594-JHR

LONG ISLAND RAILROAD,
METROPOLITAN TRANSIT AUTHORITY,
and PATRICK J. FOYE, individual,

Defendants.

August 17, 2023 3:00 p.m.

Examination before Trial of MICHELE WALSH, held pursuant to Notice, held via Zoom conference, before Ruthayn Shalom, a shorthand Reporter and Notary Public within and for the State of New York.

		2
2	APPEARANCES:	
3	BOCHNER PLLC Attorneys for Plaintiff	
4	1040 Avenue of the Americas 15th Floor	
5	New York, New York 10018 BY: CRAIG UHRICH, ESQ.	
6	craig@bochner.law	
7		
8	HOGUET NEWMAN REGAL & KENNEY, LLP Attorneys for Defendants 60 East 42nd Street, 48th Floor	
10	New York, New York 10165 BY: HELENE HECHTKOPF, ESQ.	
11	hhechtkopf@hnrklaw.com -and-	
12	BY: CONNOR G. SHEA, ESQ. cshea@hnrklaw.com	
13	ALCO DDECEME.	
14	ALSO PRESENT:	
15	Jason D. Barnes, Esq. MTA	
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

		3
2	IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by	
3	and between the attorneys for the respective	
4	parties hereto, that this examination may be	
5	sworn to before any Notary Public.	
6		
7	IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that	
8	the sealing and filing of the said examination	
9	shall be waived.	
10		
11	IT IS FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED that	
12	all objections to questions except as to form	
13	shall be reserved for trial.	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

	4
1	M. Walsh
2	MICHELE WALSH, having been
3	first duly sworn by Ruthayn Shalom, a Notary Public
4	of the State of New York, and stating her address as
5	93-02 Sutphin Boulevard, Jamaica, New York 11435,
6	was examined and testified as follows:
7	EXAMINATION BY
8	MR. UHRICH:
9	Q My name is Craig Uhrich. You may know I
10	am one of the attorneys representing Steven Rosati
11	in this matter. Would you go ahead and I know
12	we've already done it, but would you go ahead and
13	state your name for the record?
14	A Michele Walsh.
15	Q Do you have any preference on how I refer
16	to you today?
17	A No.
18	Q Ms. Walsh would be okay?
19	A Yes.
20	Q Ms. Walsh, have you ever been deposed
21	before?
22	A Yes.
23	Q How long ago was that?
24	A I don't recall.
25	Q A while ago?

5 1 M. Walsh 2 Α Yes. 3 Was it just that one time? Q 4 Α Yes. 5 Well then I'm sure that counsel already 6 has gone over how it works with you, but just to 7 make sure we are on the same page, I will go over 8 with you how I understand the ground rules of a 9 deposition, okay? 10 Α Okay. 11 Basically it's a question and answer 12 I will ask questions, you will answer. format. Ι 13 will suggest to you sometimes I get to talking 14 quickly and you may do the same. I would suggest 15 after I ask a question to give a little bit of time 16 to make sure we are not talking over each over, 17 otherwise, the court reporter will get upset with If that's okay -- and then -- I don't expect us 18 19 to be here really long today. Certainly no more 20 than seven or eight hours. 21 If, at any time, you need a break, 2.2 feel free to let me know for whatever reason. 23 only thing I would ask is if there is a question 2.4 pending, I'm going to ask that you go ahead and 25 respond to the question before we take the break.

6 M. Walsh 1 2 Also, if you need to talk to your 3 counsel or something like that, feel free to let me know and we will go off the record for that. 4 5 other thing I would ask is if, at any time, you 6 don't understand a question because I'm not always 7 the most clear person on the planet, if you don't 8 understand something let me know so I can try to 9 rephrase it. 10 Α Okay. 11 So with that all in mind let's -- give me 12 a little information about your background. Are you 13 from New York originally? 14 Yes, I am. Α 15 And are you currently with the MTA or the 16 Long Island Railroad? 17 Long Island Railroad. Α 18 What position do you hold there? Q 19 Α I'm a transportation manager. 20 Q How long have you been with the Railroad? 21 Α Since October 13, 2004. 2.2 0 Close to 20 years? 23 Α Yes. 2.4 How long have you been a manager there? Q 25 Since 2016. Α

	7
1	M. Walsh
2	Q Can you give a little bit of your history
3	there as far as what position did you start in, what
4	kind of progression did you take to become
5	transportation manager?
6	A I started as an assistant conductor, I
7	completed all the qualifications, became a conductor
8	and then in 2016 I ventured over into management.
9	Q 2016 about seven years you have been in
10	management then?
11	A Yes.
12	Q Has all of that seven years been as
13	transportation manager or have there been different
14	management positions?
15	A Transportation manager.
16	Q Can you give me an idea what exactly does
17	a transportation manager do?
18	A The day-to-day activities of the Railroad,
19	movement of trains, talking to crews, setting up the
20	station, posting paperwork that needs to be up.
21	That's our job.
22	Q So what would your what would the
23	relationship between say a conductor and a
24	transportation manager be? Are they direct reports
25	or how does that relationship work?

	8
1	M. Walsh
2	A They are direct reports but conductors
3	don't come into see managers as they report for
4	duty. They go to the train, they go to whatever
5	terminal, they don't see us.
6	Q When you say that it's a direct report
7	because I assume there is more than one
8	transportation manager; is that true?
9	A Yes.
10	Q How are conductors assigned to a
11	particular manager? Who do you know is your direct
12	report?
13	A They don't.
14	Q Okay. Do you have people that you
15	supervise directly then?
16	A No.
17	Q Who would a conductor report directly to
18	or do they?
19	A They don't report directly to anybody.
20	Q Understood. In your day-to-day activities
21	then, do you have any sort of role in disciplining
22	conductors or anything like that?
23	A Day to day?
24	Q Yes.
25	A If we are on a train and we see something

	9
1	M. Walsh
2	then we bring it up to them, but unless we are on a
3	train, we really don't have the contact with them.
4	Q Okay, I understand. What about other than
5	conductors like say just generally in a station, do
6	you have any sort of role in rule enforcement or
7	that sort of thing?
8	A With conductors, yes.
9	Q What about tell me about that. What
10	kind of role do you have in terms of rule
11	enforcement with conductors?
12	A There are rules in the book that they need
13	to follow and if they don't follow a rule then they
14	are spoken to. If they don't follow the rule again,
15	they are written up. That's basically all I know.
16	Q Let me rephrase and make sure I'm
17	understanding correctly. Basically the first
18	infraction would be a verbal warning and then there
19	is a writeup after that?
20	A Yes.
21	Q Okay. How often would you say you had to
22	give a Railroad employee a verbal warning roughly?
23	A It depends on the infraction they have
24	done.
25	Q What do you mean by that?

10 M. Walsh 1 2 If they didn't look out the Α Okay. 3 platform before they opened the doors, that's something that's going to hurt somebody. 4 5 Okay. Q 6 They are going to get written up. Α 7 Without the verbal warning? That's something that's going to 8 Yes. 9 cause harm. 10 Okay. If it's something -- would it be 0 fair to say if it's not a safety violation? 11 12 Α Yes. 13 0 Understood. Is there any sort of written 14 policy as far as what would need a verbal warning 15 versus what would need a writeup or is that your 16 discretion? 17 No, it's safety. Α So I guess what I'm asking is is there any 18 19 sort of list of things that would qualify as a 20 safety violation therefore not needing a writeup or 21 is that discretionary? 2.2 No, safety is safety. It's going to cause 23 harm. 2.4 I guess my previous question then let me 25 rephrase it. As a ballpark estimate, how often

11 M. Walsh 1 2 would you have to give employees a safety writeup? 3 If I saw them doing something. I quess what I'm asking is is this 4 5 something that you find yourself having to do daily 6 or does it happen once or twice a year? 7 Once or twice a year. 8 Okay. Have you found that that's varied 0 9 over the last handful of years? 10 I don't know. I may have phrased that poorly. 11 12 phrase it slightly differently. I'm sitting here in 13 Kansas. I'm actually one of our local prosecutors here. One thing I've noticed is before the pandemic 14 15 the sorts of cases and the number of cases I have 16 been getting has been vastly different than since 17 the pandemic. Have you noticed anything similar to that in your position? 18 19 I mostly work in an office so unless I'm on the train, I'm in a closed room. 20 21 Is it fair to say then you don't go say 2.2 patrol the station to see in there is violations 23 being committing? 2.4 No. I was in the station running the Α 25 station.

12 M. Walsh 1 What does it involve when you say you are 2 Q 3 running the station? When the rush hour comes we are setting up 4 5 trains to what track they have to go, if tracks have 6 to change, we are talking to the bureau to help move 7 the trains around. That's our day to day. 8 Q Are you assigned to one particular 9 station? 10 Α I was in Penn Station. 11 Understood. I assume you know who I'm 12 talking about when I talk about Steve or Steven 13 Rosati? 14 I heard the name. Α Okay. 15 Do you recall having had contact with him? Q 16 On the train, yes. Α 17 Tell me what you recall as far as your contact with him? 18 19 I was asked to take a train ride to 20 Jamaica, okay, because there was an employee on the 21 train that I needed to speak to who had a customer 2.2 complaint. So when I left Penn, I chose a train 23 that I could train ride which would be to do observations. Got to Jamaica, waited for the train 2.4 25 to come in that was the train that the employee was

	13
1	M. Walsh
2	on and got on the train, the employee wasn't there,
3	but Mr. Rosati was there instead.
4	Q Oh. So do I understand correctly you were
5	not going to see Mr. Rosati, you were going for
6	someone else?
7	A Yes. In fact I had to call and find out
8	who he even was.
9	Q Okay.
10	A And why the other employee was not there.
11	Q Okay, very good. Would this have been
12	around January of 2021?
13	A I really couldn't tell you. I don't know
14	the dates.
15	Q Fair enough. So I apologize, I
16	interrupted you while you were telling me what
17	happened. Go ahead and continue with what happened
18	after you found out the employee you were looking
19	for wasn't there?
20	A That was it. I had to find out who it
21	was. I was told it was him.
22	Q Okay. Did you have any conversations with
23	Mr. Rosati that day?
24	A Yes. He was walking down the aisle of the
25	train and he did not have his mask up. They were

	14
1	M. Walsh
2	allowed to wear the masks that go behind the ears or
3	they were allowed to wear the thing that pulls up.
4	Q Got it.
5	A He had the thing that pulled up, but he
6	didn't have it up. So when he got to me, I asked
7	him could you please customers are looking,
8	please pull it up.
9	Q Okay.
L O	A He did.
1	Q Would he have known that you were
L2	management at that time?
13	A Yes.
L 4	Q How would he have known that?
L 5	A I had my pass out.
L 6	Q So he complied with it. Were there any
L 7	other issues on that trip?
8 .	A He pulled it up in front of me, he walked
9	into the next car which was only six car seats away
20	from me and then pulled it back down.
21	Q How do you know he pulled it back down?
22	A Because I was standing there and I could
23	see him.
24	Q Like through the glass in the doors?
25	A Yes.

	15
1	M. Walsh
2	Q Was that the end of the encounter or was
3	there more?
4	A No. I asked him to please put it back up
5	and that I had to put him in for a noncompliance.
6	Q When you say put him in, you mean writeup?
7	A Yes.
8	Q What happened after that?
9	A I went to Penn and went into my office.
10	Q Did you write him up?
11	A Yes.
12	Q Were there any other encounterers you had
13	with Mr. Rosati? Let me strike that question and
14	ask you a different question.
15	Did you have any other contact with
16	him that day?
17	A No.
18	Q Have you had any other contact with Mr.
19	Rosati?
20	A Not that I can recall.
21	Q For my personal education on the train to
22	the Long Island Railroad, have you ever heard of a
23	two seater?
24	A Yes.
25	Q Can you tell me what that refers to?

	16
1	M. Walsh
2	A A seat only two people can sit in.
3	Q Okay. But passenger seats?
4	A Yes.
5	Q I was confused because I had seen that
6	phrase thrown around a lot. It's two people sitting
7	in the same seat?
8	A Yes.
9	Q Very good. It doesn't necessarily refer
10	to say the conductor's area on the train or anything
11	like that?
12	A No.
13	Q Thank you for that. I appreciate that
14	clarification.
15	Was there ever an incident that you
16	recall when Mr. Rosati was sitting in a two seater
17	and you approached him to say something to him about
18	a mask?
19	A I don't recall.
20	Q If he said it was on a train that was
21	going into Manhattan would that jog your memory?
22	A I don't recall.
23	Q Okay. You only recall the one instance
24	then?
25	A Yes.

	17
1	M. Walsh
2	Q When you spoke to Mr. Rosati about pulling
3	up his mask, did he say anything to you about a
4	conversation he had with Mr. Bendick?
5	A No.
6	Q Did he have any conversation with you
7	about the rules or his talks with management or
8	anything like that?
9	A No.
LO	Q Basically, he pulled up his mask and went
L1	on?
L2	A Yes.
L3	Q When he took it down and you said
L 4	something to him, did he respond to you at all in
L 5	that situation?
L 6	A No, he never no.
L 7	Q Okay. I know some things have changed in
8_	recent years. Is the mask policy still in place on
L 9	the Long Island Railroad?
20	A No.
21	Q Okay. Do you recall at the time of your
22	encounterer with Mr. Rosati exactly what the policy
23	was?
24	A I don't recall.
25	Q Do you recall if there was any element to

	18
1	M. Walsh
2	it that involved how close they were to another
3	person or anything like that?
4	A I don't recall.
5	Q Okay. Have you ever other than well
6	strike that.
7	When you say that you wrote up
8	Mr. Rosati for the mask violation, where would that
9	have gone after you wrote it up?
L O	A I submitted it in a computer. I don't
1	know where it goes.
L2	Q It's online. Is there any sort of
L3	followup interview that somebody has with you
L 4	regarding the complaint?
15	A No.
L 6	Q Basically once you submit it that's the
L 7	last you know about it?
8 .	A Yes.
L 9	Q Has anyone at the Railroad talked with you
20	about Rosati?
21	A No.
22	Q I'm just going to go through some names
23	and ask the same question about any of them. Has a
24	Mr. Bendick ever said anything to you about
25	Mr. Rosati?

		19
1		M. Walsh
2	А	No.
3	Q	Do you know who he is, by the way?
4	А	I do.
5	Q	Who would he be?
6	A	He moved to some different department. I
7	don't kno	w where he is anymore.
8	Q	At the time of these incidents or I should
9	say this	encounter with Mr. Rosati, would he have
10	been arou	nd your level or a superior to you?
11	A	He wasn't in my department.
12	Q	Do you recall what department he was in?
13	A	He was in a different one with train
14	service.	I don't know what department what he
15	was exact.	ly.
16	Q	Did you ever have a talk with a Mr. Demato
17	about Ros	ati?
18	A	No.
19	Q	What about a Mr. Eng?
20	A	No.
21	Q	Mr. Gallup?
22	A	No.
23	Q	Mr. Foye?
24	А	No.
25	Q	Okay. Other than the incident you

	20
1	M. Walsh
2	described for me, did you have any other time when
3	Mr. Rosati came to your attention?
4	A No.
5	Q Do you know Mr. Rosati's occur status with
6	the Railroad?
7	A No.
8	Q I'm pretty sure I know the answer to this
9	question, but did you ever speak to Mr. Bendick on
10	the phone while he was talking to Mr. Rosati about
11	disciplinary issues?
12	A No.
13	Q Let me go back to the mask policy. Again,
14	I realize you wouldn't recall specific numbers, but
15	about how often or how many times would you say you
16	had to speak with a Railroad employee about proper
17	mask wearing?
18	A Maybe a handful.
19	Q Was there any sort of pattern to when you
20	had to do that?
21	A When I saw it.
22	Q I guess what I'm asking is was it more
23	frequent at the beginning of the pandemic and then
24	it tapered off or was it pretty constant?
25	A I was in the office.

	21
1	M. Walsh
2	Q Did you ever have to speak to anyone in
3	the station about their mask wearing?
4	A No.
5	Q You're eliminating a lot of my questions.
6	It's going to be hard to keep you for seven hours.
7	I'm going to show you a document here. Let me get
8	it pulled up. I'm going to share my screen here.
9	(Walsh Exhibit 1, Marked for Identification.)
10	I'm going to ask you, Ms. Walsh, have
11	you ever seen this document before?
12	A What is the date on the top of it?
13	Q The only date that I have on it was the
14	date it was filed with the court in this lawsuit. I
15	don't see any other date on the document.
16	A I believe that was hung up when we talked
17	about the mask rules.
18	Q Does this look like what you're thinking
19	of?
20	(Witness perusing document.)
21	A I guess so, yes. Can you scroll it down?
22	Q Yes.
23	A Yes, I have seen that one.
24	Q This is what you were talking about when
25	you had the encounter with Mr. Rosati and told him

	22
1	M. Walsh
2	he needed to pull his mask up?
3	A No, that's not it.
4	Q It's not, okay. What would you have been
5	referring to then?
6	A That was for the customers.
7	Q This one is for the customers, okay. I'm
8	going to stop sharing my screen here.
9	Am I understanding correctly then
10	there was a separate masking policy for employees
11	versus the one for customers?
12	A That was put up, I think, on their
13	website.
14	Q Okay.
15	A I'm not sure.
16	Q But is it fair to say then that you recall
17	there being a different policy for employees of the
18	Railroad?
19	A No.
20	Q Was there a written policy for employees
21	of the Railroad?
22	A The whole policy was hung on a wall and it
23	was all described out. It was the state health
24	thing that we had to post.
25	Q Did the Railroad implement a separate

	23
1	M. Walsh
2	masking policy?
3	A No, it's the same thing. They followed
4	what the government was doing.
5	Q There wasn't a railroad specific policy,
6	you just followed the state policy?
7	A Not that I know of.
8	Q Fair enough. Let me ask you I probably
9	should have asked you this earlier. Have you been
L O	asked to collect any correspondence or emails or
1	anything like that regarding Mr. Rosati?
12	A No.
L3	Q If you were asked to do that are there any
L 4	you would be aware of?
L 5	A I would never be asked to do that.
L 6	Q I guess let me rephrase my question. Are
L 7	you aware of any correspondence or social media
8 .	posts or anything written in your possession that
L 9	would involve Mr. Rosati?
20	A Not that I'm aware of.
21	Q You mentioned the writeup you submitted
22	online. Would you have kept a printed copy of that?
23	A No.
24	Q Okay. I'm going to show another exhibit
25	here.

		24
1		M. Walsh
2	(Walsh	Exhibit 2, Marked for Identification.)
3		MR. UHRICH: This I would ask that we mark
4	as Ex	khibit Walsh 2.
5	Q	Are you able to see that picture?
6	А	Yes.
7	Q	Have you ever seen this picture before?
8	А	Yes.
9	Q	Am I correct that you're the one in the
10	front?	
11	А	Yes.
12	Q	Do you recall in what context you would
13	have seen	this picture?
14	А	What do you mean?
15	Q	How did you first become aware of this
16	picture?	
17	А	I'm in it.
18	Q	Okay. Were you aware that it was posted
19	anywhere?	
20	А	No.
21	Q	No one spoke to you about it since then?
22	А	No. I know it was posted. My boss posted
23	it.	
24	Q	Who was your boss?
25	A	My friend is Dave.

		25
1		M. Walsh
2	Q	Which one of these four people is he?
3	А	There is John also.
4	Q	Okay. Let's start at the back and you can
5	tell me w	ho is who. The guy in back with his hands
6	up, who i	s that?
7	А	John.
8	Q	The guy in the green shirt?
9	А	Dave.
10	Q	And then who is the woman sitting behind
11	you?	
12	А	Elizabeth.
13	Q	Are all four of you managers of one sort
14	or anothe	r?
15	А	No.
16	Q	Tell me, if you would, tell me who is who.
17	John, wha	t is his position?
18	А	He's a station master.
19	Q	What does a station master do?
20	А	He runs the station and he crews trains.
21	Q	Dave, what is his position?
22	А	Lead transportation manager.
23	Q	So what does he do as a opposed to what
24	you do?	
25	А	He watches over us to make sure that we do

		2	26
1		M. Walsh	
2	our jobs	correctly.	
3	Q	Would you be would he be your direct	
4	report the	en?	
5	A	Yes.	
6	Q	The woman behind you, what does she do?	
7	A	She's the same as me.	
8	Q	All of you are in some sort of management	
9	position?		
10	A	Yes, but not John.	
11	Q	Why do you say not John?	
12	A	He's not a manager.	
13	Q	Okay. But he's your boss, correct?	
14	A	No.	
15	Q	I thought you said he was your direct	
16	report?		
17	A	Not John.	
18	Q	Okay. John is the station manager?	
19	A	Station master.	
20	Q	That is not a management position?	
21	A	No.	
22	Q	Understood. Thank you for clarifying	
23	that.		
24		Where were you guys at when this	
25	picture w	as taken?	

			27
1			M. Walsh
2		A	In the station master's office.
3		Q	Do you know approximately when this would
4	have	been	taken?
5		A	It was early morning. We had a flood.
6		Q	Do you recall approximately what time
7	what		or what time of year it was taken?
8		A	I couldn't tell you the year. I don't
9	even	know	what month it was. We had a flood.
10		Q	Do you recall if it was during the
11	pande		
12	parrac	A	It had to be at the end. It had to be.
13		Q	What did you say?
14		A	I said it had to be at the end.
15		Q	At the end of the pandemic?
16		Q A	Yes.
17			
		Q	Do you recall if the mask policy was still
18	in p.		at this time?
19		A	I don't recall.
20		Q	You don't recall. Okay. It looks as if
21	none	of yo	ou are wearing masks, correct?
22		A	Yes.
23		Q	Do you recall why?
24		A	We were in our individual cubicles.
25		Q	In this picture?

			28
1		M. Walsh	
2	A	Yes.	
3	Q	Okay. Is there any sort of divider	
4	between yo	ou all?	
5	A	It's plexiglass.	
6	Q	Okay. Do you recall ever having to	
7	contact or	a phonecall with a union representative	
8	regarding	this photograph?	
9	A	No.	
10	Q	Do you recall this photograph ever	
11	appearing	anyplace else other than Facebook?	
12	A	No.	
13	Q	Do you recall ever seeing any t-shirts	
14	where this	s photograph was used?	
15	A	I heard about it.	
16	Q	What did you hear?	
17	A	I heard there was a t-shirt made.	
18	Q	Did you hear anything else about the	
19	t-shirt?		
20	A	I heard there was a t-shirt made with our	r
21	pictures o	on it.	
22	Q	Let me show you then what I will mark as	
23	Exhibit 3.		
24	(Walsh	Exhibit 3, Marked for Identification.)	
25		I'm assuming that was do you know	W

	29
1	M. Walsh
2	if that's the t-shirt they were referring to?
3	A Other than Facebook I'm not on social
4	media.
5	Q I don't blame you. Neither am I.
6	A That's very disturbing.
7	Q Why do you say it's disturbing?
8	A Why would you put that on a t-shirt.
9	Q That's a good question. Do you find it
10	disturbing for any other reason?
11	A I find it disturbing because why would you
12	put that on a t-shirt.
13	Q Let me go ahead and close it. If I
14	understand correctly today during this deposition is
15	the first time you have seen that t-shirt?
16	A Yes.
17	Q Have you ever heard of the MTA Respectful
18	Workplace Policy?
19	A There is a lot of policies. I'm sure it's
20	there.
21	Q You wouldn't recall off the top of your
22	head what it's about?
23	A No.
24	Q I assume that means you probably never had
25	to write anybody up for violating it?

30
M. Walsh
A No, not to my knowledge.
Q Have you ever seen this hand signal?
A No.
Q Have you ever seen a hand signal for okay?
A Okay is kind of like that.
Q Okay. Can you show me how you would make
the okay sign?
A (Witness complied.)
Q You consider that to mean okay?
A Yes.
Q In your mind is that a white supremacist
symbol?
A I don't know what they are.
Q You would not associate that with one in
your mind?
A I don't know what they are so I don't know
what that means.
Q Okay. Let me look through my notes here.
Like I said, you eliminated a lot of my question
with your answers. Let me go back to the encounter
with Mr. Rosati on the train. If you would tell me
again when you first encountered him on the train
where was he?
A He was in a train car collecting tickets.

	31
1	M. Walsh
2	Q He was not seated?
3	A No.
4	Q Okay. With any of your encounters with
5	Mr. Rosati on train, was he seated during any of
6	that?
7	A No.
8	Q I'm looking at the last of my notes here.
9	I believe you told me earlier but just to clarify,
10	are you aware whether or not Mr. Rosati is employed
11	by the Railroad or MTA anymore?
12	A I don't know.
13	Q Very good. In that case I have no further
14	questions and I pass the witness.
15	MR. SHEA: I'm not asking her any
16	questions.
17	MS. HECHTKOPF: Copy, please. Regular
18	delivery. Witness to read and sign.
19	(Time noted: 3:43 p.m.)
20	
21	MICHELE WALSH
22	
23	Subscribed and sworn to before me this day
24	of 2023.
25	, Notary Public.

Case 1:21-cv-08594-MMG-SN Document 100-19 Filed 05/01/24 Page 34 of 42

		32
1	M. Walsh	
2	INDEX	
3		
4	WITNESS	
5	MICHELE WALSH	
6		
7	EXAMINATION BY PAGE	
8	MR. UHRICH 4	
9		
10	EXHIBITS	
11		
12	WALSH DESCRIPTION PAGE	
13	Exhibit 1 Mask document 21	
14	Exhibit 2 Photograph 24 Exhibit 3 Picture of t-shirt 28	
15		
16	Attorney Uhrich has retained all exhibits.	
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

		33
2	CERTIFICATION	
3		
4	STATE OF NEW YORK)	
5) ss.:	
6	COUNTY OF NEW YORK)	
7		
8	I, RUTHAYN SHALOM, a Court Reporter	
9	and Notary Public within and for the State	
10	of New York, do hereby certify:	
11	That the witness whose deposition	
12	is hereinbefore set forth, was duly sworn	
13	by me, and that the within transcript is a	
14	true record of the testimony given by such	
15	witness.	
16	I further certify that I am not	
17	related to any of the parties to this action	
18	by blood or marriage, and that I am in no way	
19	interested in the outcome of this matter.	
20	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto	
21	set my hand this 31st day of August, 2023.	
22		
23		
24	<u>Rithayn Shalom</u>	
25	RUTHAYN SHALOM	

Case 1:21-cv-08594-MMG-SN Document 100-19 Filed 05/01/24 Page 36 of 42

	ERR	ATA SHEET
	CASE: ROSATI v DEPOSITION: Aug	
NAME OF : PAGE LI	DEPONENT: Miche NE(S) CHA	
/	/	/
/	/	/
/	/	/
/	/	/
/	/	/
/	/	/
/	/	/
/	/	/
/	/	/
/		
/	/	
		MICHELE WALSH
	ed and sworn to	
		, 2023 , Notary Public.
		, Notary rubire.
	MY COMMISSIC	N EXPIRES:

	02.14.17.00	l n	1 1 27 2 4
A	aware 23:14,17,20	collect 23:10	cubicles 27:24
able 24:5	24:15,18 31:10	collecting 30:25	currently 6:15
action 33:17	B	come 8:3 12:25	customer 12:21
activities 7:18 8:20	$\frac{\bf B}{\bf B}$ 32:10	comes 12:4	customers 14:7 22:6
address 4:4		COMMISSION	22:7,11
against- 1:6	back 14:20,21 15:4	34:23	D
ago 4:23,25	20:13 25:4,5 30:21	committing 11:23	D 2:14 32:2
AGREED 3:2,7,11	background 6:12	complaint 12:22	_
ahead 4:11,12 5:24	ballpark 10:25	18:14	daily 11:5
13:17 29:13	Barnes 2:14	completed 7:7	date 21:12,13,14,15
aisle 13:24	basically 5:11 9:15	complied 14:16 30:9	34:4
al 34:4	9:17 17:10 18:16	computer 18:10	dates 13:14
allowed 14:2,3	beginning 20:23	conductor 7:6,7,23	Dave 24:25 25:9,21
Americas 2:4	believe 21:16 31:9	8:17	day 8:23,23 12:7,7
and- 2:11	Bendick 17:4 18:24	conductor's 16:10	13:23 15:16 31:23
answer 5:11,12 20:8	20:9	conductors 8:2,10,22	33:21 34:20
answers 30:21	bit 5:15 7:2	9:5,8,11	day-to-day 7:18 8:20
anybody 8:19 29:25	blame 29:5	conference 1:19	Defendants 1:10 2:8
anymore 19:7 31:11	blood 33:18	confused 16:5	delivery 31:18
anyplace 28:11	BOCHNER 2:3	CONNOR 2:11	Demato 19:16
apologize 13:15	book 9:12	consider 30:10	department 19:6,11
appearing 28:11	boss 24:22,24 26:13	constant 20:24	19:12,14
appreciate 16:13	Boulevard 4:5	contact 9:3 12:15,18	depends 9:23
approached 16:17	break 5:21,25	15:15,18 28:7	DEPONENT 34:5
approximately 27:3	bring 9:2	context 24:12	deposed 4:20
27:6	bureau 12:6	continue 13:17	deposition 5:9 29:14
area 16:10		conversation 17:4,6	33:11 34:4
asked 12:19 14:6	$\frac{\mathbf{C}}{\mathbf{C} \cdot \mathbf{C} \cdot \mathbf{C}}$	conversations 13:22	described 20:2 22:23
15:4 23:9,10,13,15	C 2:2 4:2 33:2,2	copy 23:22 31:17	DESCRIPTION
asking 10:18 11:4	call 13:7	correct 24:9 26:13	32:11
20:22 31:15	car 14:19,19 30:25	27:21	different 7:13 11:16
assigned 8:10 12:8	case 1:6 31:13 34:4	correctly 9:17 13:4	15:14 19:6,13 22:17
assistant 7:6	cases 11:15,15	22:9 26:2 29:14	differently 11:12
associate 30:15	cause 10:9,22	correspondence	direct 7:24 8:2,6,11
assume 8:7 12:11	Certainly 5:19	23:10,17	26:3,15
29:24	certify 33:10,16	counsel 5:5 6:3	directly 8:15,17,19
assuming 28:25	change 12:6 34:5	COUNTY 33:6	disciplinary 20:11
attention 20:3	changed 17:17	court 1:1 5:17 21:14	disciplining 8:21
Attorney 32:16	chose 12:22	33:8	discretion 10:16
attorneys 2:3,8 3:3	clarification 16:14	Craig 2:5 4:9	discretionary 10:21
4:10	clarify 31:9	craig@bochner.law	DISTRICT 1:1,1
August 1:12 33:21	clarifying 26:22	2:6	disturbing 29:6,7,10
34:4	clear 6:7	crews 7:19 25:20	29:11
		CIEWS 1.19 23.20	
LATTHORITY 1.9	close 6:22 18:2 29:13		divider 28:3
AUTHORITY 1:9 Avenue 2:4		cshea@hnrklaw.co 2:12	

21:20 32:13	32:13,13,14	given 33:14	2:10
doing 11:3 23:4	exhibits 32:16	glass 14:24	history 7:2
doors 10:3 14:24	expect 5:18	go 4:11,12 5:7,24 6:4	HOGUET 2:8
duly 4:3 33:12	EXPIRES 34:23	8:4,4 11:21 12:5	hold 6:18
•	EAPIRES 34:23	13:17 14:2 18:22	hour 12:4
duty 8:4	$\overline{\mathbf{F}}$	20:13 29:13 30:21	hours 5:20 21:6
	F 33:2		hung 21:16 22:22
E 2:2,2 4:2,2 32:2,10	Facebook 28:11 29:3	goes 18:11 going 5:24 10:4,6,8	hung 21:10 22:22 hurt 10:4
33:2	fact 13:7	10:22 13:5,5 16:21	Hurt 10.4
earlier 23:9 31:9	fair 10:11 11:21	18:22 21:6,7,8,10	I
early 27:5	13:15 22:16 23:8	22:8 23:24	idea 7:16
ears 14:2	far 7:3 10:14 12:17	good 13:11 16:9 29:9	Identification 21:9
East 2:9	feel 5:22 6:3	31:13	24:2 28:24
education 15:21	filed 21:14	government 23:4	implement 22:25
eight 5:20	filing 3:8	green 25:8	incident 16:15 19:25
element 17:25	find 11:5 13:7,20	ground 5:8	incidents 19:8
eliminated 30:20	29:9,11	guess 10:18,24 11:4	individual 1:3,9
eliminating 21:5	first 4:3 9:17 24:15	20:22 21:21 23:16	27:24
Elizabeth 25:12	29:15 30:23	guy 25:5,8	information 6:12
emails 23:10	flood 27:5,9	guys 26:24	infraction 9:18,23
employed 31:10	Floor 2:4,9	guys 20.24	instance 16:23
employee 9:22 12:20	follow 9:13,13,14	H	interested 33:19
12:25 13:2,10,18	followed 23:3,6	H 4:2,2 32:10	interrupted 13:16
20:16	follows 4:6	hand 30:3,5 33:21	interview 18:13
employees 11:2 22:10	followup 18:13	handful 11:9 20:18	involve 12:2 23:19
22:17,20	form 3:12	hands 25:5	involved 18:2
encounter 15:2 19:9	format 5:12	happen 11:6	Island 1:8 6:16,17
21:25 30:21	forth 33:12	happened 13:17,17	15:22 17:19
encountered 30:23	found 11:8 13:18	15:8	issues 14:17 20:11
encounterer 17:22	four 25:2,13	hard 21:6	
encounterers 15:12	Foye 1:9 19:23	harm 10:9,23	J
encounters 31:4	free 5:22 6:3	head 29:22	J 1:9
enforcement 9:6,11	frequent 20:23	health 22:23	Jamaica 4:5 12:20,24
Eng 19:19	friend 24:25	hear 28:16,18	January 13:12
ERRATA 34:2	front 14:18 24:10	heard 12:14 15:22	Jason 2:14
Esq 2:5,10,11,14	further 3:7,11 31:13	28:15,17,20 29:17	job 7:21
estimate 10:25	33:16	HECHTKOPF 2:10	jobs 26:2
et 34:4		31:17	jog 16:21
exactly 7:16 17:22	G	held 1:18,18	John 25:3,7,17 26:10
19:15	G 2:11	HELENE 2:10	26:11,17,18
examination 1:17 3:4	Gallup 19:21	help 12:6	
3:8 4:7 32:7	generally 9:5	hereinbefore 33:12	K 11.12
examined 4:6	getting 11:16	hereto 3:4	Kansas 11:13
exhibit 21:9 23:24	give 5:15 6:11 7:2,16	hereunto 33:20	keep 21:6
24:2,4 28:23,24	9:22 11:2	hhechtkopf@hnrk	KENNEY 2:8
l			

kept 23:22	7:14 14:12 17:7	necessarily 16:9	originally 6:13
kind 7:4 9:10 30:6	26:8,20	need 5:21 6:2 9:12	outcome 33:19
know 4:9,11 5:22 6:4	manager 6:19,24 7:5	10:14,15	
6:8 8:11 9:15 11:10	7:13,15,17,24 8:8	needed 12:21 22:2	P
12:11 13:13 14:21	8:11 25:22 26:12,18	needing 10:20	P 2:2,2
17:17 18:11,17 19:3	managers 8:3 25:13	needs 7:20	p.m 1:13 31:19
19:7,14 20:5,8 23:7	Manhattan 16:21	Neither 29:5	page 5:7 32:7,11 34:5
24:22 27:3,9 28:25	mark 24:3 28:22	never 17:16 23:15	pandemic 11:14,17
30:14,17,17 31:12	Marked 21:9 24:2	29:24	20:23 27:11,15
knowledge 30:2	28:24	New 1:1,21 2:5,5,9,9	paperwork 7:20
known 14:11,14	marriage 33:18	4:4,5 6:13 33:4,6,10	particular 8:11 12:8
	mask 13:25 16:18	NEWMAN 2:8	parties 3:4 33:17
L	17:3,10,18 18:8	noncompliance 15:5	pass 14:15 31:14
L 4:2,2	20:13,17 21:3,17	Notary 1:20 3:5 4:3	passenger 16:3
lawsuit 21:14	22:2 27:17 32:13	31:25 33:9 34:20	PATRICK 1:9
Lead 25:22	masking 22:10 23:2	noted 31:19	patrol 11:22
left 12:22	masks 14:2 27:21	notes 30:19 31:8	pattern 20:19
let's 6:11 25:4	master 25:18,19	Notice 1:18	pending 5:24
level 19:10	26:19	noticed 11:14,17	Penn 12:10,22 15:9
LINE(S) 34:5	master's 27:2	number 11:15	people 8:14 16:2,6
LIRR 34:4	matter 4:11 33:19	numbers 20:14	25:2
list 10:19	mean 9:25 15:6 24:14		person 6:7 18:3
little 5:15 6:12 7:2	30:10	0	personal 15:21
LLP 2:8	means 29:24 30:18	O 33:2	perusing 21:20
local 11:13	media 23:17 29:4	objections 3:12	phone 20:10
long 1:8 4:23 5:19	memory 16:21	observations 12:24	phonecall 28:7
6:16,17,20,24 15:22	mentioned 23:21	occur 20:5	photograph 28:8,10
17:19	METROPOLITAN	October 6:21	28:14 32:13
look 10:2 21:18 30:19	1:9	office 11:19 15:9	phrase 11:12 16:6
looking 13:18 14:7	Michele 1:17 4:14	20:25 27:2	phrased 11:11
31:8	31:21 32:5 34:5,18	Oh 13:4	picture 24:5,7,13,16
looks 27:20	mind 6:11 30:12,16	okay 4:18 5:9,10,18	26:25 27:25 32:14
lot 16:6 21:5 29:19	month 27:9	6:10 8:14 9:4,21	pictures 28:21
30:20	morning 27:5	10:2,5,10 11:4,8	place 17:18 27:18
M	move 12:6	12:14,20 13:9,11,22 14:9 16:3,23 17:17	Plaintiff 1:4 2:3
M 4:1,2 5:1 6:1 7:1	moved 19:6	17:21 18:5 19:25	planet 6:7 platform 10:3
8:1 9:1 10:1 11:1	movement 7:19	22:4,7,14 23:24	please 14:7,8 15:4
12:1 13:1 14:1 15:1	MTA 2:14 6:15 29:17	24:18 25:4 26:13,18	31:17
16:1 17:1 18:1 19:1	31:11	27:20 28:3,6 30:5,6	plexiglass 28:5
20:1 21:1 22:1 23:1	N	30:7,8,10,19 31:4	PLLC 2:3
24:1 25:1 26:1 27:1	$\overline{N} 2:2 32:2 33:2$	once 11:6,7 18:16	policies 29:19
28:1 29:1 30:1 31:1	name 4:9,13 12:14	online 18:12 23:22	policy 10:14 17:18,22
32:1	34:4,5	opened 10:3	20:13 22:10,17,20
management 7:8,10	names 18:22	opposed 25:23	22:22 23:2,5,6
		-PP	
	1	1	•

27:17 29:18	6:20 7:18 9:22	16:16 17:2,22 18:8	SHEA 2:11 31:15
poorly 11:11	15:22 17:19 18:19	18:20,25 19:9,17	SHEET 34:2
position 6:18 7:3	20:6,16 22:18,21,25	20:3,10 21:25 23:11	shirt 25:8
11:18 25:17,21 26:9	23:5 31:11	23:19 30:22 31:5,10	shorthand 1:19
26:20	read 31:18	34:4	show 21:7 23:24
positions 7:14	realize 20:14	Rosati's 20:5	28:22 30:7
possession 23:18	really 5:19 9:3 13:13	roughly 9:22	sign 30:8 31:18
post 22:24	reason 5:22 29:10	rule 9:6,10,13,14	sign 30.8 31.18 signal 30:3,5
post 22.24 posted 24:18,22,22	34:5	rules 5:8 9:12 17:7	signar 50.5,5 similar 11:17
posted 24.18,22,22 posting 7:20	recall 4:24 12:15,17	21:17	sit 16:2
posting 7.20 posts 23:18	15:20 16:16,19,22	running 11:24 12:3	sitting 11:12 16:6,16
preference 4:15	16:23 17:21,24,25	runs 25:20	25:10
PRESENT 2:13	18:4 19:12 20:14	runs 23.20 rush 12:4	situation 17:15
	22:16 24:12 27:6,10		six 14:19
pretty 20:8,24 previous 10:24	27:17,19,20,23 28:6	Ruthayn 1:19 4:3 33:8,25	slightly 11:12
_	28:10,13 29:21	33.0,23	social 23:17 29:3
printed 23:22	record 4:13 6:4 33:14	S	
probably 23:8 29:24	refer 4:15 16:9	S 2:2 4:2 32:10	somebody 10:4 18:13
progression 7:4		safety 10:11,17,20,22	sort 8:21 9:6,7 10:13
proper 20:16	referring 22:5 29:2 refers 15:25	10:22 11:2	10:19 18:12 20:19
prosecutors 11:13		saw 11:3 20:21	25:13 26:8 28:3
Public 1:20 3:5 4:3	REGAL 2:8	screen 21:8 22:8	sorts 11:15
31:25 33:9 34:20	regarding 18:14	scroll 21:21	SOUTHERN 1:1
pull 14:8 22:2	23:11 28:8 Page 1-1-21:17	sealing 3:8	speak 12:21 20:9,16
pulled 14:5,18,20,21	Regular 31:17	seat 16:2,7	21:2
17:10 21:8	related 33:17	seated 31:2,5	specific 20:14 23:5
pulling 17:2	relationship 7:23,25	seater 15:23 16:16	spoke 17:2 24:21
pulls 14:3	rephrase 6:9 9:16	seats 14:19 16:3	spoken 9:14
pursuant 1:18	10:25 23:16	see 8:3,5,25 11:22	ss 33:5
put 15:4,5,6 22:12	report 8:3,6,12,17,19	13:5 14:23 21:15	standing 14:22
29:8,12	26:4,16	24:5	start 7:3 25:4
Q	reporter 1:20 5:17	-	started 7:6
qualifications 7:7	33:8	seeing 28:13 seen 16:5 21:11,23	state 1:21 4:4,13
qualify 10:19	reports 7:24 8:2	24:7,13 29:15 30:3	22:23 23:6 33:4,9
quanty 10.19 question 5:11,15,23	representative 28:7	30:5	STATES 1:1
5:25 6:6 10:24	representing 4:10	separate 22:10,25	stating 4:4
15:13,14 18:23 20:9	reserved 3:13	service 19:14	station 7:20 9:5
23:16 29:9 30:20	Respectful 29:17	set 33:12,21	11:22,24,25 12:3,9
questions 3:12 5:12	respective 3:3	setting 7:19 12:4	12:10 21:3 25:18,19
21:5 31:14,16	respond 5:25 17:14	seven 5:20 7:9,12	25:20 26:18,19 27:2
quickly 5:14	retained 32:16	21:6	status 20:5
quickly 5.14	ride 12:19,23	Shalom 1:19 4:3 33:8	Steve 12:12
R	role 8:21 9:6,10		Steven 1:3 4:10 12:12
R 2:2 33:2	room 11:20	33:25 share 21:8	STIPULATED 3:2,7
railroad 1:8 6:16,17	Rosati 1:3 4:10 12:13	sharing 22:8	3:11
1	13:3,5,23 15:13,19	31141 Hig 44.0	stop 22:8
Ĭ		I	I

S4110 04 2.0	4h:1-22.12	ion 20.7	
Street 2:9	think 22:12	union 28:7	went 15:9,9 17:10
strike 15:13 18:6	thinking 21:18	UNITED 1:1	WHEREOF 33:20
submit 18:16	thought 26:15	upset 5:17	white 30:12
submitted 18:10	thrown 16:6	V	witness 21:20 30:9
23:21	tickets 30:25		31:14,18 32:4 33:11
Subscribed 31:23	time 5:3,15,21 6:5	v 34:4	33:15,20
34:19	14:12 17:21 19:8	varied 11:8	woman 25:10 26:6
suggest 5:13,14	20:2 27:6,7,18	vastly 11:16	work 7:25 11:19
superior 19:10	29:15 31:19	ventured 7:8	Workplace 29:18
supervise 8:15	times 20:15	verbal 9:18,22 10:7	works 5:6
supremacist 30:12	today 4:16 5:19	10:14	wouldn't 20:14 29:21
sure 5:5,7,16 9:16	29:14	versus 10:15 22:11	write 15:10 29:25
20:8 22:15 25:25	told 13:21 21:25 31:9	violating 29:25	writeup 9:19 10:15
29:19	top 21:12 29:21	violation 10:11,20	10:20 11:2 15:6
Sutphin 4:5	track 12:5	18:8	23:21
sworn 3:5 4:3 31:23	tracks 12:5	violations 11:22	written 9:15 10:6,13
33:12 34:19	train 8:4,25 9:3 11:20		22:20 23:18
symbol 30:13	12:16,19,21,22,23	W	wrote 18:7,9
	12:24,25 13:2,25	W 4:2	
T	15:21 16:10,20	waited 12:24	X
T 32:10 33:2,2	19:13 30:22,23,25	waived 3:9	X 1:2,11 32:2,10
t-shirt 28:17,19,20	31:5	walked 14:18	
29:2,8,12,15 32:14	trains 7:19 12:5,7	walking 13:24	Y
t-shirts 28:13	25:20	wall 22:22	year 11:6,7 27:7,7,8
take 5:25 7:4 12:19	transcript 33:13	Walsh 1:17 4:1,14,18	years 6:22 7:9,12
taken 26:25 27:4,7	TRANSIT 1:9	4:20 5:1 6:1 7:1 8:1	11:9 17:18
talk 6:2 12:12 19:16	transportation 6:19	9:1 10:1 11:1 12:1	York 1:1,21 2:5,5,9,9
talked 18:19 21:16	7:5,13,15,17,24 8:8	13:1 14:1 15:1 16:1	4:4,5 6:13 33:4,6,10
talking 5:13,16 7:19	25:22	17:1 18:1 19:1 20:1	
12:6,12 20:10 21:24	trial 1:17 3:13	21:1,9,10 22:1 23:1	Z
talks 17:7	trip 14:17	24:1,2,4 25:1 26:1	Zoom 1:18
tapered 20:24	true 8:8 33:14	27:1 28:1,24 29:1	
tell 9:9 12:17 13:13	try 6:8	30:1 31:1,21 32:1,5	0
15:25 25:5,16,16	twice 11:6,7	32:11 34:5,18	1
27:8 30:22	two 15:23 16:2,6,16	warning 9:18,22 10:7	1 21.0 22.12
telling 13:16	13.23 10.2,0,10	10:14	1 21:9 32:13
terminal 8:5	U	wasn't 13:2,19 19:11	1:21-cv-08594-JHR
terms 9:10	Uhrich 2:5 4:8,9 24:3	23:5	1:7
testified 4:6	32:8,16	watches 25:25	10018 2:5
testimony 33:14	understand 5:8 6:6,8	way 19:3 33:18	10165 2:9
Thank 16:13 26:22	9:4 13:4 29:14	we've 4:12	1040 2:4
thing 5:23 6:5 9:7	understanding 9:17	wear 14:2,3	11435 4:5
11:14 14:3,5 22:24	22:9	wearing 20:17 21:3	13 6:21
23:3	Understood 8:20	27:21	15th 2:4
things 10:19 17:17	10:13 12:11 26:22	website 22:13	17 1:12 34:4
unings 10.19 1/.1/	10.13 14.11 40.44		
	1	I	I

	\sim
71	1 1

		40
1	ı	1
2		
2 24:2,4 32:13		
20 6:22		
2004 6:21		
2016 6:25 7:8,9		
2021 13:12		
2023 1:12 31:24		
33:21 34:4,20		
21 32:13		
24 32:13		
28 32:14		
20 32.11		
3		
3 28:23,24 32:14		
3:00 1:13		
3:43 31:19		
31st 33:21		
3180 33.21		
4		
432:8		
42nd 2:9		
48th 2:9		
5		
<u> </u>		
6		
60 2:9		
00 2.9		
7		
8		
9		
93-02 4:5		
)		
	<u> </u>	<u> </u>